



ARGUPOLIS PhD Program Argumentation in context

DIALOGUE GAMES

Prof. Erik C. W. Krabbe

University of Lugano, March 30-31 2010

Course description

This is a course in formal dialectic, a subject shortly introduced in last year's logic course ('Logic and Formal Dialectic'). It is intended to enrich the scope of your experience with formal dialectic by the study of a number of particular dialogue games (also called: 'systems of formal dialectic'). Though this course is a kind of sequel to the logic course, and the latter course will certainly help you to master the concepts, the vocabulary, and the notations used by formal dialecticians, I wouldn't make the logic course a prerequisite for following the present course. But those who were not in the logic course, should have at least some slight acquaintance with propositional logic and should study the paper 'Logic and Games' from the reader before the course starts (others may want to reread it).

After a general introduction, we shall study two types of dialogue games: Hamblin games and Lorenzen games. We'll start with the Hamblin games, first of all Hamblin's own "Why-Because system with questions", also known as 'system H', then some of Mackenzie's systems. We'll see how these systems handle problems relating to traditional fallacies such as begging the question, many questions, and equivocation. Next come the Lorenzen games, an example of which was presented in the logic course. We shall have a look at the way rules for these games can be motivated from the point of view of argumentation theory. Otherwise than in Hamblin games, in these games the concept of a winning strategy is of paramount importance. We shall go through many examples to get a good grasp of the way these games work. Finally, we shall discuss the advantages and drawbacks of the two types of games and see how one can have the best of both by embedding dialogues of the Lorenzen type into those of the Hamblin type.

Classes will consist of a mixture of lecturing, close readings of parts of some of the papers in the reader, discussions, and individual work on exercises.

For those who need credit, the course will be concluded by an essay (about 3000 words) on a subject connected with formal dialectic, to be submitted before the end of June. You will receive some comment on your essay by the end of July.

Time schedule

Tuesday, March 30

Afternoon 14-18

1. Introduction
2. Hamblin's system H; the Woods and Walton segment
3. Mackenzie's systems 1 (consistency), 2 (begging the question) and 3 (equivocation)
4. Exercises

Wednesday, March 31

Morning 9-12

1. Discussion of exercises
2. Motivation for the rules of some systems of formal dialectic
3. Essentials of Lorenzen games and examples

Afternoon 14-18

1. Winning strategies and dialogical tableaux
2. Exercises in Lorenzen games
3. Comparison and discussion of the two types of games
4. Embedding of Lorenzen games into Hamblin games

References

There is a reader for this course with (fragments of) papers and books, taken from some of the items here mentioned.

Else M. Barth (1982). A Normative-Pragmatical Foundation of the Rules of Some Systems of Formal₃ Dialectics. In: Else M. Barth and Jo L. Martens (eds.). *Argumentation: Approaches to Theory Formation: Containing the Contributions to the Groningen Conference on the Theory of Argumentation, October 1978* (pp. 159-170). Amsterdam: John Benjamin, 1982.

Else M. Barth and Erik C.W. Krabbe (1982). *From Axiom to Dialogue: A Philosophical Study of Logics and Argumentation*. Berlin and New York: Walter de Gruyter.

Charles L. Hamblin(1970). *Fallacies*. London: Methuen. Reprinted with a preface by John Plecnik and John Hoaglund in 1986, Newport News, VA: Vale Press.

Jaakko Hintikka (1973). *Logic, Language-Games and Information: Kantian Themes in the Philosophy of Logic*, Oxford: Clarendon/Oxford U.P.

Jaakko Hintikka (1981). The Logic of Information-Seeking Dialogues: A Model. In: Werner Becker and Wilhelm K. Essler (eds.). *Konzepte der Dialektik*. Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, pp. 212-231.

Wilfrid Hodges and Erik C. W. Krabbe (2001). Dialogue Foundations, *The Aristotelian Society: Supplementary Volume 75 (The Symposia Read at the Joint Session of the Aristotelian Society and the Mind Association at the University of York July 2001)*, 17-49. Part I (Wilfrid Hodges): A Sceptical Look, pp. 17-32; Part II (Erik C. W. Krabbe): Dialogue Logic Restituted [title misprinted as 'Dialogue Logic Revisited'], pp. 33-49.

Wilhelm Kamlah and Paul Lorenzen(1973). *Logische Propädeutik: Vorschule des vernünftigen Redens*. 2nd improved and enlarged ed. Mannheim, etc.: Bibliographisches Institut, Wissenschaftsverlag. First edition 1967. *Hochschultaschenbücher* 227.

Wilhelm Kamlah and Paul Lorenzen (c1984). *Logical Propaedeutic: Pre-School of Reasonable Discourse*. Translation of *Logische Propädeutik* by Hoke Robinson. Lanham, MD and London: University Press of America.

- Erik C. W. Krabbe (1985). Noncumulative Dialectical Models and Formal Dialectics. *Journal of Philosophical Logic* 14, 129-168.
- Erik C. W. Krabbe (1985a). Formal Systems of Dialogue Rules. *Synthese* 63, 295-328.
- Erik C. W. Krabbe (1988). Creative Reasoning in Formal Discussion. *Argumentation* 2, 483-498.
- Erik C. W. Krabbe(1998). Dialogical Logic. In: Edward Graig (ed.), *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy, vol. 3*, London and New York: Routledge, pp. 59-62.
- Erik C. W. Krabbe(2001). The Problem of Retraction in Critical Discussion. *Synthese: An International Journal for Epistemology, Methodology and Philosophy of Science* 127, 141-159.
- Erik C. W. Krabbe(2002). Profiles of Dialogue as a Dialectical Tool. In: Frans H. van Eemeren (ed.), *Advances in Pragma-Dialectics*, Amsterdam: Sic Sat and Newport News, VA: Vale Press, pp. 153-167.
- Erik C. W. Krabbe (2006). Dialogue Logic. In: Dov M. Gabbay and John Woods (eds.), *Handbook of the History of Logic 7: Logic and the Modalities in the Twentieth Century*, Amsterdam, etc.: Elsevier, pp. 665-704.
- Erik C. W. Krabbe (2006a). Logic and Games. In: Peter Houtlosser and Agnès van Rees (eds.), *Considering Pragma-Dialectics: A Festschrift for Frans H. van Eemeren on the Occasion of his 60th Birthday*, Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum, pp. 185-198.
Translation from the Dutch.
- Erik C. W. Krabbe (2009). Cooperation and Competition in Argumentative Exchanges. In: Henrique Jales Ribeiro (ed.), *Rhetoric and Argumentation in the Beginning of the XXIst Century*. Coimbra: Imprensa da Universidade de Coimbra, pp. 111-126.
- Van Laar, Jan Albert (2003). *The Dialectic of Ambiguity: A Contribution to the Study of Argumentation*. Dissertation, Groningen University. Retrievable from <http://irs.ub.rug.nl/ppn/249337959>.
- Paul Lorenzen. Logik und Agon(1960). In: *Atti del XII Congresso Internazionale di Filosofia (Venezia, 12-18 Settembre 1958), IV: Logica, linguaggio e comunicazione*, Firenze: Sansoni, pp. 187-194. Reprinted in Lorenzen and Lorenz, 1978, pp. 1-8.
[Mackenzie, 1979] J. D. (Jim) Mackenzie. How to Stop Talking to Tortoises. *Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic* 20 (1979), 705-717.
- Paul Lorenzen (1987). *Lehrbuch der konstruktiven Wissenschaftstheorie*. Mannheim, etc.: Bibliographisches Institut, Wissenschaftsverlag.
- Paul Lorenzen and Kuno Lorenz (1978). *Dialogische Logik*. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft [Mackenzie, 1985]
- J. D. (Jim) Mackenzie (1979). How to Stop Talking to Tortoises. *Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic* 20, 705-717.
- J. D. (Jim) Mackenzie (1979a). Question-Begging in Non-Cumulative Systems. *Journal of Philosophical logic* 8, 117-133.
- Jim Mackenzie (1985). No Logic Before Friday. *Synthese* 63 (1985), 329-341.
- Jim Mackenzie (1988). Distinguo: The Response to Equivocation. *Argumentation* 2, 465-482.
- Jim Mackenzie (1990). Four Dialogue Systems. *Studia Logica* 4, 567-583.
- Shahid Rahman and Helge Rückert (eds.) (2001). *New Perspectives in Dialogical Logic (= Synthese 127)*.
- Chris Reed and Timothy J. Norman (eds.) (2003). *Argumentation Machines: New Frontiers in Argument and Computation*. Dordrecht, etc.: Kluwer.
- Nicholas Rescher (1977). *Dialectics: A Controversy-Oriented Approach to the Theory of Knowledge*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Douglas N. Walton (1984). *Logical Dialogue-Games and Fallacies*, New York and London: Lanham.

- Douglas N. Walton and Erik C. W. Krabbe (1995). *Commitment in Dialogue: Basic Concepts of Interpersonal Reasoning*. Albany NY: State University of New York Press.
- John Woods and Douglas N. Walton (1978). Arresting Circles in Formal Dialogues. *Journal of Philosophical logic* 7, 73-90. Reprinted in Woods and Walton (1989) as Chapter 10, pp. 143-159.
- John Woods and Douglas N. Walton (1989). *Fallacies: Selected Papers, 1972-1982*. Dordrecht and Providence, RI: Foris.